

D. Program Evaluation

Appendix D contains an analysis of the effectiveness of the existing housing element; the appropriateness of goals, objectives, and policies; and the progress in implementing programs for the previous planning period.

1. Accomplishments

The 2006-2014 Housing Element goals were drafted to implement the required statutes in California housing element law and followed priorities expressed by the Barstow community, including input received from the City Council, Planning Commission, and City staff. To that end, the housing element contained 4 primary goals, along with 32 supporting policies and twenty implementation programs.

The four goals were:

- **Goal HE-1. Provide a Range of Housing by Location, Type and Price to Meet the Growth Needs of the City.** Promote an adequate supply and diversity of quality rental and ownership housing opportunities suited to residents of varying lifestyle needs and income levels.
- **Goal HE-2. Conserve and Improve the Conditions of the City's Existing Housing Stock.** Expand and protect opportunities for households to find housing in Barstow and afford a greater choice of rental and homeownership opportunities.
- **Goal 3. Preserve and Enhance the Quality of Residential Neighborhoods in Barstow and Ensure that New Housing is Sensitive to the Existing Natural and Built Environment.** Promote and maintain sustainable neighborhoods of quality housing, parks and community services, infrastructure, and other services that maintain and enhance neighborhood character and the health of residents.
- **Goal 4. Promote Equal Opportunity for All Residents in the Housing of Their Choice.** Provide adequate housing opportunities and support services for Barstow seniors, people with disabilities, families with children, and people in need of emergency, transitional, or supportive housing.

Following the adoption of the Housing Element in 2015, Barstow was tasked with following through on its implementation programs. This task has been curtailed by the slow recovery from the most severe recession since the Great Depression and significant loss in tax revenues. Meanwhile, in an effort to bail out California's budget deficit, the Legislature and Governor re-appropriated billions of dollars in local redevelopment dollars, eventually leading to the

dissolution of redevelopment altogether. In 2013, the Governor then vetoed AB 1229, which would have allowed cities to continue inclusionary housing state law.

Although a recovering economy may eventually produce a California budget surplus in the foreseeable future, local governments are left with a permanent and structural deficit in long-term funding for housing.

Goal HE-1: Provide a Range of Housing by Location, Type and Price to Meet the Growth Needs of the City

The prior Housing Element identified 9 policies to encourage the development of a variety of housing to meet the needs of the City. Most of these goals were focused on either “encouragement” or “promoting” such activities. However, they are only as successful as the willingness of the developers to participate. During the height of the residential development in the mid-2000s, the focus was on introductory housing, even though the City encouraged move-up and higher-end housing. Similarly, developers were not interested in building low-income or affordable housing except for TCAC funded projects. Although two TCAC funded projects were constructed, two more were proposed, but have yet to obtain approval for the funding. One may see construction within this Housing Element Cycle. The developer does not intend on developing the second project for some time.

One item mentioned in the prior Housing Element was to allow the development of second units in single-family zones. Prior to 2009, this was permitted in single-family zones, but with a conditional use permit, and not permitted in multi-family residential. On July 20, 2009, the City adopted an amendment to the ordinance to allow second units to be approved administratively, and inclusive of multiple-residential units, consistent with State law. This established an administrative process instead of discretionary. Since its adoption, no second units have been built. In the past 30+ years, only two applications for second units were constructed.

Goal HE-2: Conserve and Improve the Condition of the City’s Existing Housing Stock

The City’s prior Housing Element identified six policies to move towards the conservation and improvement of the existing housing stock within the City. One of the primary tools used for this has been Code Enforcement. Some of the struggles with this include the prevalence of out-of-area land (absentee) owners that have purchased the property for a tax write-off with little interest in the condition of the property. Some property owners have lost their house due to the economy (where the banks evict them, yet do not transfer the property into the banks name), or non-compliant property owners. All non-compliant property owners (whether absentee or not) may be directed by the courts if other enforcement actions are not successful.

Prior to the 2014-2021 Housing Element, the City had worked with County agencies to make available to the public funds for citizens to improve their project, through programs such as “Project Facelift.” However, most of the funds are no longer available. Whenever funds are available, the City ensures that the public is aware of them, and assists in the processing of the necessary paperwork.

Goal 3: Preserve and Enhance the Quality of Residential Neighborhoods in Barstow and Ensure that New Housing is Sensitive to the Existing Natural and Built Environment

There are nine policies associated with this goal. Of these policies, some were enforced simply because they are state requirements (prohibit residential development in hazard areas, energy conservation devices). Others were simply not addressed for the lack of any type of development (i.e., low and moderate-income housing cannot be concentrated in any single area). Still, others were not addressed simply because standards may have already been in place, or there was such a low potential of occurrence, or other code amendment addressed it, that there was no further action taken. Still others simply do not justify any action at this time (higher density residential development to be located in close proximity to public transportation, services and recreation). As the City has no transit center, there is no impetus to direct such development when transit stops are located throughout the City.

Given the recession, the policies within this goal became, for the most part, ineffective. If development had occurred as was proposed (we would have more than doubled the number of residential units), more of these policies would have been implemented.

GOAL 4: PROMOTE EQUAL OPPORTUNITY FOR ALL RESIDENTS TO RESIDE IN THE HOUSING OF THEIR CHOICE

This goal includes only two policies geared toward ensuring that residents have an opportunity to live in the housing of their choosing. The City has never taken a position of indicating where an individual or family should locate, other than in a residential zone. In addition, in 2011, the City adopted the “Reasonable Accommodations” ordinance. This provides a method of permitting accessibility of an individual to the house of their choosing. This was never an issue in the past, but State law requires an ordinance indicating such. As a tracking measure, the City will review for approval, by means of a no-cost application (plans necessary would be required for any construction permits), the proposed reasonable access plan (i.e., ramps, lifts, widening of doorways, etc.). To date, no applications have been received.

The following Table D-1 contains a summary of the progress for each program and suitability for inclusion in the 2014-2021 Housing Element Amendment.

Table D-1: Program Evaluation, 2014-2021 Housing Element

Programs	Implementation Actions and Progress		
	Action	Timeframe	Progress and Evaluation
Program 1: Code Enforcement/(Code Compliance & Emergency Enforcement)	Continue program implementation; reallocate resources to achieve goals. Coordinate efforts with health department officials in responding to health and safety concerns	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: Program considered effective; Code Compliance typically have at least 300 cases at any given time. There may be a need to further educate people regarding property maintenance requirements.</p> <p>Status: Program will continue for the 2014-2021 planning period.</p>
Program 2: Downtown Barstow	Complete comprehensive General Plan update and specific plan for the Downtown Historic Route 66 Area	Completed	<p>Evaluation: The City adopted a comprehensive General Plan update in 2015, followed by a comprehensive zoning ordinance amendment and the adoption of the Route 66 Business Corridor and Downtown Business and Cultural District Specific Plan.</p> <p>Status: The plans have been adopted and are being implemented.</p>
Program 3: Housing Inspection	Complaint and safety driven by Building and Fire Department Inspectors.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: As this is typically complaint driven, it is only as effective as the tenants that lodge the complaints. However, upon inspections based upon the complaints, corrective actions, if necessary, are required.</p> <p>Status: Program continues to be implemented.</p>
Program 4: Historic Preservation	While the City is interested in preserving the history of Barstow, only one structure is on the National Registry of Historic Places, that being the Historic Harvey House.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: The City continues to maintain the Harvey House and has rented portions out to museums and the FAA. Other recent uses include a NASA exhibit.</p> <p>Status: The Public Works department continues to maintain the Historic Harvey House and grounds.</p>

Programs	Implementation Actions and Progress		
	Action	Timeframe	Progress and Evaluation
Program 5: Housing Design	The City adopted a design review ordinance for development, including housing. The principles set the foundation, and City residential guidelines that work in tandem with the development standards of the zoning ordinance or appropriate specific plans.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: Since the adoption of the ordinance, there has only been three residential permits. As future development occurs, a more comprehensive evaluation can be supplied.</p> <p>Status: Continued implementation of design guidelines as development occurs.</p>
Program 6: Housing Sites	With the adoption of the comprehensive General Plan and zoning ordinance updates, the City increased the density of smaller lot residential development, multi-family development and adopted a density bonus ordinance.	General Plan Update and zoning ordinance adopted	<p>Evaluation: As noted under Program 5 above, this will be better evaluated in the coming years as residential development occurs.</p> <p>Status: Continued implementation of the adopted zoning ordinance and General Plan.</p>
Program 7: Diverse Use	This General Plan designation and zoning district encourages the implementation of a live/work situation, or a true mix of residential and commercial development.	Completed	<p>Evaluation: As of the writing of this document (2017), no projects have utilized the true intent of this district. However, it has only been two years since it's adoption, and the housing market has not yet returned to the pre-recession demand.</p> <p>Status: Continued implementation of adopted General Plan and zoning ordinance.</p>
Program 8: Resource Conservation	The City adopted the CalGreen standards, adopted an alternative energy ordinance, and continues to work with the local water purveyors and the City's wastewater treatment staff to finalize written policies and programs to prioritize water and sewer service allocation.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: The Building Department requires new development to be consistent with the CalGreen standards. The City has also adopted an alternative energy ordinance to remove governmental barriers for solar, wind generation, and provisions for electric vehicle charging.</p> <p>Status: Continued implementation.</p>

Programs	Implementation Actions and Progress		
	Action	Timeframe	Progress and Evaluation
Program 9: Identification and Alleviation of Potential Constraints	Implementation of development review/design review process; re-evaluate appropriateness of development fee schedules; periodically review potential constraints to the development, maintenance, and improvement of housing as situations arise.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: With a minimal of housing occurring at this time, it is difficult to evaluate the effectiveness of this program as of the writing of this document (2017). It is anticipated that these programs will be beneficial for future development as the City is receiving several inquiries regarding housing development.</p> <p>Status: Continued implementation of programs.</p>
Program 10: Alternative Housing Opportunities	As part of the 2015 General Plan Update and 2015 zoning ordinance update, the City reduced the lot sizes, allowing for lots of 4,500 square feet. In addition, the City updated the ordinance for Second Units.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: The City adopted small lot standards to encourage additional residential development. However, the recovery from the recession has been slow. Therefore, this cannot be properly evaluated at this time.</p> <p>Status: Continued implementation of ordinances for smaller lots and second units.</p>
Program 11: Financial Assistance	Contingent upon the availability of funding for financial assistance, availability of surplus land for write-downs, and reduced fees in return for developers providing affordable housing	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: Currently, there is no funding source for financial assistance provided through the City. The City does have various properties for sale, but most is for commercial or industrial development. The City also works with developers for land assemblage. Reduced development fees are a possible tool as well, but as of the writing of this document (2017), no developments have been submitted to utilize these programs.</p> <p>Status: Pending request from developers.</p>
Program 12: Rental Housing Assistance	Primarily provided through San Bernardino County, several options are available such as Housing Choice Vouchers, Project Based Vouchers and Public Housing Units. Emergency Rental Assistance is supported by private non-profit agencies and organizations with the assistance of the City.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: The program has seen an increase in demand as the Housing Choice Vouchers has increased from 161 in 2015, to 257 in 2017. While this is indicative of the current economic situation of the region, it is not moving sufficient amounts of people into home ownership.</p> <p>Status: The program is expected to continue through and beyond the 2014-2021 planning period. Whether there is an increase in the need of vouchers is yet to be determined.</p>

Programs	Implementation Actions and Progress		
	Action	Timeframe	Progress and Evaluation
Program 13: Affordable Housing Preservation	Continue to monitor affordable units that are at-risk of converting to market-rate and consider alternatives to replace or conserve the quantity of units. Many of the market-rate apartments and rental housing are affordable to all but the extremely low and very low-income groups. Therefore, it is important to expand the partnership and funding opportunities to leverage resources for housing programs.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: While the City has no immediate concerns of at-risk housing converting, there is a possibility of one facility converting in 2023. However, the City has also entered into an Exclusive Negotiating Agreement for a potential affordable senior housing project. This project has the potential to offset the number of potential housing lost should the one complex convert to market-rate in 2023.</p> <p>Status: The program is expected to continue beyond the 2014-2021 planning period.</p>
Program 14: Housing for Disabled People	The City follows ADA mandates for accessibility. In addition, the City adopted a reasonable accommodations ordinance 2011, allowing individuals an opportunity to occupy the housing of their choice.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: The Building Department requires new address ADA requirements for multi-family housing.</p> <p>Status: The City adopted an ordinance consistent with state guidelines reasonable accommodations and follows all ADA guidelines (state and federal).</p>
Program 15: Housing for Seniors	The City supports the provision of senior housing and life care facilities and preservation of affordable housing as funding is available.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: As noted earlier, it has only been two years since the last update. Therefore, a proper evaluation is not possible at this time. However, the City does continue to seek and support the potential for senior housing.</p> <p>Status: The City entered into an Exclusive Negotiating Agreement for the potential development of an affordable and market-rate senior housing project. This project also has the support of San Bernardino County and is a needed project for the aging population.</p>

Programs	Implementation Actions and Progress		
	Action	Timeframe	Progress and Evaluation
Program 16: Homeless Services	Numerous churches in the Barstow area collaborated to provide emergency services to the homeless and sponsored the development of Desert Manna. In addition, the City rents the Desert Manna facility for \$1 a year. In addition, CDBG grants have been used for New Hope Village and the City acquired \$1 homes that were then sold to New Hope, Too! for long-term or permanent housing.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: The City has one homeless shelter (Desert Manna) providing between 32-36 beds, and has New Hope Village with 10 Transitional Units for Rapid Rehousing New Hope Village’s prior 6 unit facility is now a market-rate complex. New Hope, Too! offers long-term or permanent housing with two units. In addition, the Haley House provides housing for women and their children of domestic violence who would be homeless otherwise. All of these help to serve the homeless community in Barstow.</p> <p>Status: The programs will continue beyond the 2014-2021 planning period.</p>
Program 17: Housing Education and Monitoring	Annually monitor the progress in meeting the objectives of the housing element and prepare annual reports; conduct ongoing educational efforts to engage and inform the public, decision makers, and stakeholders about the housing issues; at the midpoint of the 2014-2021 housing element period, review select programs and activities and fine tune and adjust as deemed necessary.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: The annual reporting of the Housing Element is a requirement of state law, and the City has been preparing the reports each year. Educational efforts are limited at this time, especially since the document is only two years old. As this is the midpoint of the document, this portion of Program 17 is being met.</p> <p>Status: Portions of this program are ongoing, while the midpoint review of this Housing Element is provided by this update.</p>
Program 18: Housing For People Who Are Homeless	Prior to the adoption of the 2014-2021 Housing Element, the City did not have a zone designation to allow by right, homeless shelters. As part of the comprehensive zoning ordinance update in 2015, the City designated a zone to allow homeless shelters by right.	Adopted	<p>Evaluation: As required by SB2, the City amended the zoning ordinance allowing a zoning district that allows, by right, the establishment of homeless shelters. This district classification has sufficient land available to address the homeless housing needs for several years to come.</p> <p>Status: The program will continue through the 2014-2021 planning period. A homeless shelter is proposed within this zoning district, pending funding.</p>

Programs	Implementation Actions and Progress		
	Action	Timeframe	Progress and Evaluation
Program 19: Density Bonus	The City completed a comprehensive zoning ordinance amendment in 2015. As part of that amendment, the City included the state mandated Density Bonus. An amendment in 2017 addressed Assembly Bills and Senate Bills in September 2016.	Adopted	<p>Evaluation: As of 2015, no requests for a density bonus have been submitted.</p> <p>Status: The program will continue Beyond the 2014-2021 planning period.</p>
Program 20: Equal Housing Opportunities	The Inland Fair Housing & Mediation Board fulfills the requirements of the Fair Housing Council by distributing education materials to property owners, apartment managers and tenants every two years, making public service announcements (PSAs) via different media at least two times a year, conducts public presentations with community groups, responds to complaints of discrimination, and referring services to appropriate agencies.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: This is a program implemented by the Inland Fair Housing & Mediation Board. The information provided is beneficial for both tenants and landlords in the proper conduct of the tenant and landlord.</p> <p>Status: The program continues beyond the 2014-2021 planning period.</p>
Program 21: Equal Housing Opportunities	The Inland Fair Housing & Mediation Board refers discrimination complaints to the Fair Housing Network for resolution. In addition, a pamphlet on equal housing opportunities is updated monthly and distributed to the public through a variety of groups and locations. Local nonprofits, service organizations and community groups help to distribute fair housing information.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: This is a program implemented by the Inland Fair Housing & Mediation Board. The information provided is beneficial for both tenants and landlords in the proper conduct of the tenant and landlord.</p> <p>Status: The program continues beyond the 2014-2021 planning period.</p>

Programs	Implementation Actions and Progress		
	Action	Timeframe	Progress and Evaluation
Program 22: At-Risk Program	To guard against loss of affordable housing, the City must monitor units that are at-risk of conversion to market-rate. Currently, only one apartment complex is at-risk of converting in 2023. Work with potential purchasers, establishing contact with public and nonprofit agencies to purchase and/or manage at-risk units. Where feasible, provide technical assistance and support to these organizations with respect to financing. The City will work with tenants of at-risk units and provide them with education regarding tenant rights and conversion procedures, Housing Voucher programs, etc.	Ongoing	<p>Evaluation: The City continues to work with any agency, private developer, etc. to provide affordable housing to address potential at-risk affordable housing.</p> <p>Status: The program continues beyond the 2014-2021 planning period. In addition, the City entered into an exclusive negotiating agreement with a developer to provide affordable and market-rate senior housing.</p>

2. Public Outreach

California law requires that local governments include public participation as part of the housing element. Specifically, Government Code section 35583(c)(7) states “that the local government shall make a diligent effort to achieve public participation of all economic segments of the community in the development of the housing element, and the program shall describe this effort.” State law does not specify the means and methods for participation; however, it is generally recognized that the participation must be inclusive.

The City of Barstow continues to engage the community in defining City housing needs and discussing creative ways to address them within the unique constraints facing the City. During the preparation for this housing element, the City’s outreach program included the following venues:

- **Land Use Workshops.** During the preparation of the land use element, the City of Barstow held two workshops that included housing and the land use plan. Held during 2013 and 2014, these workshops discussed residential growth, types of housing products desired,

which does not necessarily meet with state guidelines. More recently, and for the update, the initial workshop was held September 25, 2017. A second workshop was held 11/13/2017.

- **Stakeholder Interviews:** The City has discussed housing needs with stakeholders (via telephone and email in 2014) as well as at the workshops and commission hearings. This included those that provide emergency and transitional housing, and rapid-rehousing. In 2017 (via email) the City inquired whether there were any additional comments, changes or recommendations. The City received comments from approximately 75% of those contacted.
- **Commission Hearings.** Barstow has an active planning commission that is designed to obtain public input. The meetings are televised and available to view on the web, live, and afterwards. The City solicited input on the housing element from the public prior to its recommendation to the City Council.

This is a draft version of the amendment of the 2014-2021 Housing Element. Additional public review of this document will result in changes and an update of this section.

Public Comments: Housing Supply and Diversity

Participants raised issues about providing the appropriate mix and affordability of units. This includes not only traditional forms of housing, but also alternative models that might provide more opportunities for affordable housing for seniors.

Key ongoing themes heard include (2014):

- **Affordable Housing.** Participants of the General Plan Workshop conclusively indicated that Barstow did not warrant additional affordable housing (58%). A similar question posed later indicated 84% were opposed to additional affordable housing. This is primarily because, although the RHNA identifies additional need, this need is an anticipated increase in those income groups, not necessarily additional households. The City has an abundance of housing that is affordable, and the participants expressed the viewpoint that other housing types were necessary. The City cannot deny affordable housing projects. This is an indication though that the public believes the City needs to focus on other types of housing.
- **Moderate Income Units.** The participants of the General Plan Workshop indicated by a vote of 82% that moderate income housing should be a focus. This confirms staff's belief that this is an underserved market, and aligns with the RHNA, identifying a higher number of moderate income housing units than low, very low, and extremely low housing units.
- **Executive Housing Options.** Similar to above, 71% of the participants voted that new executive housing is important. As with the moderate income units, this confirms staff's

belief as well. Likewise, the RHNA numbers were comprised of 43% for this above moderate income households needed, making up the largest segment of needed housing.

- **Condominiums and Townhomes.** When the participants of the General Plan Workshop were queried on condominiums and townhomes, 74% of the participants indicated the City should pursue seeking this type of development. Previously, this segment has not worked in the Barstow area, with one project built (The Barstonian), later turning into apartments, and another proposed, but later built as apartments. However, that was more than 20 years ago. The input from participants is one indication that this may be a viable housing option.
- **Affordable Senior Housing.** The General Plan Workshop inquired about two types of senior housing, assisted living, and active seniors. Although the City used an electronic voting device, verbal comments from the audience indicated that the senior housing should be affordable. The votes were 97% and 85%, respectively. This gives a clear direction of where some of the focus should be.
- **Small Lot Ordinance.** Although not specifically discussed at the 2014 workshop, one mechanism to create affordable housing is to reduce the lot size, essentially increasing the number of lots for subdivisions. This also makes some projects more marketable as a larger project can be more feasible.

It should be noted that at the public workshop held September 25, 2017, no comments regarding the Housing Element was presented. In addition to reviewing the goals, the City also revisited the key themes noted above. There were no recommended changes to the above themes.